
REPORT 4
(1215/13/IM)

**RATIFICATION OF THE MAKARA/OHARIU COMMUNITY
BOARD SUBMISSION TO THE PROJECT MILL CREEK
RESOURCE CONSENT APPLICATION**

It is recommended that the Makara/Ohariu Community Board:

1. *Receive the information.*
2. *Ratify the Board submission to the Project Mill Creek Resource Consent Application.*

Attached is the Board submission to the:

- Project Mill Creek Resource Consent Application (Appendix 1)

APPENDIX 1

Submission by:

**MAKARA OHARIU COMMUNITY BOARD
on the resource consent applications by
MERIDIAN ENERGY LTD for
PROJECT MILL CREEK**

To:

**Greater Wellington Regional Council 0803681
Wellington City Council 176538
Porirua City Council 5202-LU0048/08**

The Makara Ohariu Community Board (MOCB) opposes the applications for resource consents by Meridian Energy Ltd for Project Mill Creek in the respect that, at this point in time, visual, noise and cumulative effects on the resident community cannot be adequately assessed, nor can sediment from construction earthworks on local streams and the Makara Estuary be adequately managed.

LANDSCAPE AND VISUAL AMENITY EFFECTS

Pre-application consultation

The manner in which this proposal was announced meant that Makara residents were not aware that it might effect them. Most Makara residents became aware of the proposal after the initial meetings in Ohariu Valley had commenced. Maps provided to residents as part of the pre-application consultation did not show Makara Rd and Makara Beach. Owners of the adjacent properties (sharing partial northern and entire western boundaries with the proposed site) were not made aware of the project at all until after it had been announced to Ohariu Valley residents.

MOCB submits that Meridian has pitched this proposal to locals and to the public at large as an 'Ohariu Valley' wind farm, but it's impact and effects will be shared in the majority by Makara residents, who will be, and already are affected by the West Wind project now under construction.

APPENDIX 1

Photo Simulations

As a result, many Makara residents did not know to 'request' photo simulations of the turbines, and some relied on a general request by the Makara Guardians for simulations from their properties. Many residents from both Ohariu and Makara were declined requested simulations due to Meridian's setting of a cut-off date prior to the application being lodged.

24 homes on Ohariu Valley Rd or Takarau Gorge Rd, and **54 homes on Makara Rd**, are sited within 2km of Mill Creek turbines.

Meridian has provided 65 photo simulations to Ohariu Valley or Takarau Gorge residents, and **7 to Makara residents**.

MOCB submits that WCC requests under section 92 of the Resource Management Act, further photo simulations from Meridian, prior to a Hearing, to/for all consented dwellings that will see those turbines or parts of turbines from within the notional boundaries (20m) of their dwellings (existing trees excluded). MOCB submits that it is the applicant's responsibility to approach and inform both effected local residents and the Council of any likely visual effect. Failure to do so will not enable effected parties to know they may be effected and thereby may deprive them of the right to submit on the application. More importantly, without this essential information, the Council officer preparing the report for the Hearings Committee, will not have the information necessary to reasonably assess visual effect.

In the interim, MOCB opposes the turbines that will most likely have significant adverse visual impact on private dwellings and from the Makara Walkway, on the western and southern perimeters, and these are G1, G2, G3, G4, K3, F9, F10, F11, F13 and F14. We reserve the right to refine and/or add to this list pending further visual simulations.

APPENDIX 1

NOISE EFFECTS

MOCB submits that there is not enough information in the AEE to adequately assess the impact of noise on residents.

Project West Wind provides an excellent physical opportunity to assess the actual noise from the same model turbine in very similar circumstances - in real time, at a similar distances from residences and in local conditions. MOCB submits that the Mill Creek application is premature and notes that the same application, were it made in the near future when the West Wind turbines are operational, would be able to include significantly more information and evidence about noise effects and would therefore be much easier to assess. This responsible approach to effect will be helpful for the applicant, the Council, and the residents.

MOCB also submits that the Project West Wind 'conditions' incorporating both NZS6808 and 'sub-6808' conditions, are in practice turning out to be unclear, impractical and problematic, and are not sufficient to rely on for protecting residential amenity.

ACCESS ROAD

MOCB supports the approach that construction traffic be prevented from traveling through Makara and Takarau Gorge Roads.

Again, MOCB feels there is insufficient detailed information about how the Councils, having granted Meridian the right to construct a road for site access on/through Council land, propose to close the road for vehicular access after the construction period is complete. MOCB understands the concerns of residents that a Council who can grant a licence for access almost one year ago and not inform them of the likely affect of such grant, can be trusted to implement a vague undertaking made on their behalf by the applicant. MOCB requests some hard proposals be put to the Hearings committee by WCC and PCC on future proposals for the land and road, with the requisite legal undertakings made to assure residents of it's future restricted access.

APPENDIX 1

CONSTRUCTION TRAFFIC

MOCB submits that a Traffic Management Plan does not adequately or practically manage construction traffic, and that conditions specifying what constitutes construction traffic, and limitations on hours and days of operation must be incorporated into any consent.

ECOLOGY

MOCB submits that the EMP and SEMP have proven to be inadequate for management of sediment run-off at Project West Wind, in that to date, there have been a number of significant sediment spills into private property and the Makara, South Makara and Karori Streams from very average rainfall events. MOCB again submits that this application is therefore premature as there is insufficient time to fully assess the problems being faced at West Wind, and therefore to work out how to improve on them for Mill Creek, in the event that consent for Mill Creek is granted.

MOCB requests the opportunity to speak to this submission.

Prepared by Ruth Paul (Chairperson)
on behalf of the
MAKARA OHARIU COMMUNITY BOARD
12th June 2008